

Citizens Advisory Council on Captive Cervids Meeting

August 28, 2003

Indianapolis, Indiana

Fort Benjamin Harrison St. Park

□

Attendees:

Council Members: Chuck Bauer, Paula Yeager, Pete Hanebutt, Frank Keeton, David Dimmich, Doug Metcalf, Doug Allman, Glenn Lange, Gene Hopkins, Brad Thurston

Facilitator: □ Tom Wasson; Recorder: □ Jeanie Odaffer; Secretary: □ Debbie Bray
□ □ □ □ □ □ □ □

Special Guests: DNR Director John Goss, Deputy Director John Davis, BOAH Director, Bret Marsh, Representative Bill Friend, Division of Fish and Wildlife Director, Glen Salmon,

Guests: □ Approximately 15 citizens observed all or most of the Meeting

□

Meeting Objectives: □

1. □ □ □ □ Welcome/Purpose by Directors
2. □ □ □ □ How CACCC will conduct business
3. □ □ □ □ Comments & Expectations of Council Members
4. □ □ □ □ Learn about current laws, rule & regulations

□

Opening Remarks & Charge to Council

Deputy Director Davis served as host for the opening meeting of the CACCC. □ He welcomed all attendees; introduced the Council Members, Special Guests and turned the meeting over to Director Goss, Representative Friend and Dr. Marsh for opening comments.



Director Goss spoke regarding the Council's focus and charge and reviewed the sideboards.□He believes the council is a balanced and capable group, which will work together to develop a plan.

CACCC Focus: To resolve conflicts between various interest groups relating to the taking/possession of captive reared cervids.□

CACCC Charge: to develop administrative rule, legislative recommendations, and/or policy changes toward this focus topic.

Sideboards:

- 1.□□□□Meetings must be completed May 15, 2004.□Final report due by June 15, 2004
- 2.□□□□Stakeholder council must devise viable funding proposal for any program, administrative rule, legislative and/or policy changes that require additional state funding.
- 3.□□□□Any solution by stakeholder council must be consistent with core values of BOAH and DNR.
- 4.□□□□Stakeholder council representatives must develop ways to involve the stakeholders they represent.
- 5.□□□□All meetings will be open to public and allow some public input at each meeting.□ Meeting locations will be held in various parts of the state.
- 6.□□□□Stakeholder council will establish a series of separate public meetings to obtain input on any proposed recommendations.
- 7.□□□□No proxies allowed for stakeholders representatives on the council.□ Representatives, when not able to attend a meeting, may appoint an observer to be recognized at the meeting.

Representative Friend spoke to the importance of the council work and that Representative Tiny Adams and himself both are both very supportive of the council.

Director Marsh believes there is a synergism within the council and they will work together to create a plan.□This council will pioneer the process, which can and will be replicated in other parts of the nation.

After the Directors' opening comments Mr. Davis turned the meeting over to the Facilitator, Tom Wasson.

The council was asked if they had any questions for the Directors about the Charge, Focus or Sideboards.

No questions or comments about the Charge or Focus. However, one question about how a disease problem that needed immediate action would be handled. Dr. Marsh advised that BOAH would take the necessary action, but would advise the council as soon as possible.

Below is listed each of the agenda topics; an outline of the important points, discussion and decisions.

Agenda Review: The meeting objectives and agenda was reviewed and agreed upon.

How Business is Conducted: - To help the council understand how the council meetings will be conducted Tom Wasson gave a presentation asking councils for decisions about various items during the presentations

□

Facilitated Meetings

- Need Different Roles

- Distinguish between

- Process - How things are done.

- Content – What is discussed and decided

□

Roles and Responsibilities:

Facilitator – to guide/help council to accomplish its goals in a logical and efficient manner and to maintain ground rules and sideboards. To finalize meeting reports and assist the CACCC to develop a final report

Recorder – to create group memory on flip chart, transcribe flip chart into report and assist Secretary as needed

Council Members – Understand and work toward mission of the group. Know and adhere to ground rules & sideboards. Apply all experience and skills and contribute as fully as possible. Strive for agreement. Carry out between meeting assignments. Make sure the recorder records accurately.

Secretary – Provide clerical support: web page, meeting reports, distribution of materials, room arrangements, lodging and refreshments. □ Coordinates public comments, DNR Public Affairs Unit/News releases and handle council expenses.

Resource Person’s Role – Provide information as requested

Public’s Role – Attend any session of council and participate in the public input.

Ground Rules: □ The following ground rules were discussed and agreed upon.

1. □ Start and end on time
2. □ Hold one conversation at a time
3. □ Honor points of view that are different from yours
4. □ Don’t interrupt
5. □ Speak openly and honestly
6. □ Keep comments short and to the point
7. □ Take on assignments between meetings.
8. □ Attendance/promptness
9. □ Breaks and get refreshments as needed
10. □ Cell phones set on vibrate
11. □ Document any statement to determine if factual. □ (Have right to challenge.)

□

Meeting Logistics & Schedules:

Reviewed some of the housekeeping aspects of council meetings. □ During the discussion about meeting logistics the council decided that public input was very important. □ If possible it was decided that:

1. □ Some of the meetings be evenings and/or Saturdays for public input
2. □ Set meetings dates/locations well in advance
3. □ Hold two Two-day sessions, one North and one South; hold the public input during the evening of the first day.

Timeline/Milestones

· Final Report due by June 15, 2004, one of the sideboards

A draft Tasks/Milestones and Timeline handout was distributed and reviewed. The following are some of the comments/discussion points.

· Public input large part of council responsibilities

· October & January meetings for public input. Evening meetings 3 to 9 PM? or 12 to 9 PM

· One Saturday meeting

· Limit three (3) minutes for each individual in public input session of Council working meeting. No Q & A. Input for council consideration.

· Recommendations for meetings (type, date, time of meetings) due in the “What Next” portion of the meeting after lunch (Gene, Brad, Tom, Glenn, Doug M.)

Council Communication

· Provide a notebook to keep meeting reports, resource materials, etc.

· How to communicate with council members. Please fill out form with phone, e-mail etc. to determine the preferred way to communication. Also, requested a emergency contact in case of last minute changes.

· Meeting Reports- the goal is to have them distributed one week after meeting.

Public Input/Communication

Two of the sideboards given the Council involve public input/communication. A very important element to build public support for the Council recommendations

██████████The Council agreed upon the following list:

1. ██████████Website – no links to other organization sites. Website address – www.dnr.IN.gov/cervidcouncil
2. ██████████Letters and email received will be collated & provided to Council by Secretary
3. ██████████Mailing list collected at meetings to send information to interested parties.
4. ██████████During public input sessions at council meeting: Three (3) minutes is time limit for comments. No Q & A
5. ██████████E-mail comments only accepted, person should not expect an individual reply.
6. ██████████How to answer questions? Questions “will be forwarded to all Council to be discussed”
 - a. ██████████Questions posted on list server
 - b. ██████████Questions posed will NOT get individual answer. “Please watch website for Council deliberations” this phrase to be on website.
 - c. ██████████Council will try to address questions and get answers.
7. ██████████Look at wording of “CERVID” on web site including native and non-native species.
8. ██████████Let website stand as informational only NO links to participating organizations provided. List ONLY name of Council member and group represented on DNR website.
9. ██████████Try to presort website questions for council.
10. ██████████DNR will staff website.
11. ██████████Encourage individuals who provide verbal comments at council meeting to also give written comments: To help make it easy will provide a form with name, address and space for comments. This is not required, just suggested, so get thing right.
12. ██████████The four public meetings should be publicized:

a. ██████████ Council members should inform constituents

b. ██████████ News releases should be made

Comments/Expectations by Members:

1. ██████████ Evansville, Isaac Walton League: Expectation: No set expectations.
Organization has a policy in opposition to Deer/Elk farms.

2. ██████████ Indiana Wildlife Federation: Common sense and wise use of resources.
Expectation: Look at both sides of issue and best use of resources for Indiana

3. ██████████ Indiana Farm Bureau: Largest farm organization. Expectation: Neutral on issues.

4. ██████████ Indiana Elk Farmers: Goal is to stay in business Expectation: work together for reasonable solution and provide knowledge about Elk industry.

5. ██████████ Deer breeder/Farmer-owner: Expectation: solutions which satisfy all of group.

6. ██████████ Board of Animal Health: Sphere of responsibility:

- ██████████ Inspection

- ██████████ Pasteurization

- ██████████ Health of animals

Expectation: to reach consensus by which all citizens and species can become more noble by what we do.

7. ██████████ Indiana Sportsman Roundtable: is a compilation of different groups.
Expectations: to do something good for future generations.

8. ██████████ Department of Natural Resources (DNR): is a regulating agency.
Expectation: Formulate some recommendations that prevent disease, allow for free range deer hunting, balances wild cervid populations between wildlife recreation, public and landowners.

9. ██████████ Deer farmer Association: Note attachment. Expectation: Advance core values of Indiana deer farmers.

10. ██████████ Indiana Deer Hunters Association. Wishes to protect hunting heritage for future generations. Expectation: Waiting to see.

The First Step:

██████████ Gaining knowledge about Current Rules & Regulations

████████████████████ Board of Animal Health (BOAH): Presentation by Gary Haynes

████████████████████ See handout

████████████████████ Questions/Comments

a. ██████████ How is “wild” defined by BOAH? Wild is not defined by statute.

b. ██████████ Seems to be a conflict between the two agencies on what roles are.

c. ██████████ How are animals identified? What methods of identification are used? Tags, tattoos, carcass tags. What other methods? A list of methods is requested for the next meeting.

d. ██████████ There is a need to get a better idea of who is “out there” (elk breeders, deer farmers, pen hunt facilities)

e. ██████████ Breeders are policing themselves?

f. ██████████ There is a need to have an update on CWD and the tests to determine if animals are infected.

Fish and Wildlife Code: Presentation by Lt. Col. Jeff Wells

a. ██████████ Codes were founded to minimize commercialism.

c. ██████████ Game breeder licenses were designed for supplemental stocking to release to the wild.

d. ██████████ Game breeder licenses permit sale of white tailed deer for “breeding purposes only”.

e. ██████████ White tailed deer are “wild”

f. ██████████ Culling is not addressed in the statute.

g. ██████████ Individuals can charge a fee to hunt on private property.

h. ██████████ Cannot possess white tailed deer without “game breeders permit” in Indiana.

i. ██████████ Hard to tell difference between captive and wild deer.

j. ██████████ Need to have prosecutors and judge support of statute to prosecute.

□

Public Input

Purdue School of Agriculture – has offered it’s support if there is a need for information they can supply.

Deer Farmers Association –advisor from Michigan. □ Stated that Michigan did what Indiana is doing now. Offered to the Council that they needed to develop a working trust to progress. □ The Michigan group decided there were actually three types of deer: wild, captive, privately owned. □ Michigan considers a fence over 52 inches high and over one-quarter mile long as “captive”.

□

What Next:

□

The following schedule of meetings were agreed upon by the Council:

██████████ September 15th and 16th, , 2003 □ (Monday-Tuesday)

· ██████████ overnight session

· ██████████ Council meet during the day

· ██████████ Evening public comment session

· ██████████ 6th AM tour

· ██████████ PPM discussion and preparation for next meeting on second day

· See elk and white tailed deer facility (Bellar?)

· Digital visit's created by DNR and BOAH

· Independent study visits by Council members encouraged

October 7, 2003 Tuesday

November 19, 2003 Wednesday

December 4, 2003 Wednesday

January 17, 2004 Saturday

February 10th & 11th, 2004 two day meeting with evening session.

What do you need to know? What information would you like to have to help you in your charge?

1. Facts of industry in Indiana. Need list of Game breeders permit holders.

2. Animal Health – testing

3. Current Regulations of keeping captive Cervids.

4. What is going on Nationwide in the industry? Other states?

5. U.S. Department of Agriculture – do they have anything?

6. Scientific study

7. Southeast Co-op Study (Paula Yeager has)

8. Expert testimony – First hand experience (Invite Wisconsin DNR and Animal Health personnel to meeting also Indiana BOAH veterinarian.

9. Enforcement – who is responsible for enforcement of regulations and how are they doing it.

Next Meeting Agenda

·███████Share resource materials

·███████Start to ID the issues that we must address to meet our charge

·███████Site visits

□

███████Homework:

1.██████████████Identify issues

2.██████████████Identify and notify constituents of meetings and website.

3.██████████████If you have resources and/or materials please provide to Debbie Bray before next meeting.

□

Meeting Report edited and approved on September 15, 2003